

# Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, December 17, 2019

Hyperlink to [Meeting Video](#)

## Community Plan Advisory Committee

**Attending:** Chair Kai Nishiki, Hans Michel, Karen J. Comcowich, Leilani Pulmano, Donald Robert Gerbig, Ravi Bugga, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom, Joseph D. Pluta, Dylan Payne, Yvette Joyce Celiz, Aina Kohler

**Absent:** Vice-Chair Jeri Dean

## County of Maui – Planning Department

Pam Eaton, Long Range Planning Division  
Jennifer Maydan, Long Range Planning Division  
Kate Blystone, Long Range Planning Division  
Tiffany Bostwick, Long Range Planning Division

## Call to order

### **Public Testimony (00:00 to 21:56 in Meeting Video)**

Jonathan Kindred, testifying on behalf of TY Management, offered alternative language for Policy 1 in Goal 2.1: Ready and Resilient Systems.

Darren McDaniel reiterated the need to balance the population with the resources available, and expressed his concern regarding policies concerning water availability. He suggested there should be no development until current and future water needs can sustain future populations. He also expressed concern with a bed and breakfast policy in Goal 2.4: Economic Opportunity through Innovation and Collaboration. Questions from CPAC included how many kids Darren has; and clarifying which bed and breakfast policy he was referring to (he corrected his testimony: the policy was in Goal 2.1: Ready and Resilient Systems).

Brad Paulson expressed concern about Policy 2a under Goal 2.4: Economic Opportunity through Innovation and Collaboration, specifically how it would negatively affect existing communities/neighborhoods. He suggested either amending or deleting the policy because he felt it was inconsistent with the goals stated throughout CPAC proceedings or with the policies in the Maui Island Plan.

Albert Perez encouraged members to provide their own population target in the Community Plan rather than work around the State projection. He voiced his support for Option 2 in Policy 1 of Goal 2.1: Ready and Resilient Systems. He reiterated his suggestion from testimony at a previous meeting to delete the 3.2(ft) number from Policy 2, and suggested deleting the second half (“except a minimum...”). He also encouraged members to prohibit seawalls completely to protect the Public Trust. Dawn Hegger-Nordblom asked Albert for alternative language for the policies in his testimony; he did not have any at the moment, but said he could provide them with language on the Public Trust.

Lawrence Cabonilla asked about the flood conditions between Prison and Dickenson Street ma uka of Honoapiʻilani Highway and expressed his concerns with previous flooding issues in that area. Hans Michel noted that this is part of the incomplete stormwater system.

### **Policies and Actions Related to Goal 2.2: A Complete, Balanced and Connected Transportation Network (21:56 to 1:17:27)**

Pam Eaton recognized the resource people available to answer questions from CPAC members regarding policies and actions in Goal 2.2: A Complete, Balanced and Connected Transportation Network: Robin Shishido (Hawaiʻi State Department of Transportation), Marc Takamori (Maui County Department of Transportation), and Lauren Armstrong (Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization).

Jennifer Maydan introduced the newest CPAC member (replacing Joseph Aquino): Angela Lucero. She provided a brief overview of the policies and actions for the five goals of the Community Plan, and recommended focusing on the highlighted items before entertaining any edits for existing items or proposing new policies and actions.

### **ACTIONS**

19. Establish a regional network of multiuse bicycle and pedestrian paths and protected bike lanes in West Maui. (Department of Parks and Recreation) **(25:07 to 27:51)**

- Discussion:
  - Members discussed the relationship between Actions 12 and 19, specifically whether they are in support of or in conflict with each other; whether funding should be listed; and where the paths should be.
- Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt/Keep as is**

20. Establish a short-term plan to protect key roadways from sea level rise and storm events, to provide alternatives that prevent shoreline armoring as the default emergency action. (Department of Public Works) **(27:51 to 43:48)**

- Discussion:
  - Resource person Robin Shishido provided an update on plans for Honoapiʻilani Highway, including shifting the roadway ma uka within the existing right of way; and a planning and environmental linkage study for Mileposts 10-18.5.
  - Questions from CPAC included whether the State Department of Transportation is looking at short-term measures as well; the location of the state baseyard and if the County shares its baseyard; if lane shifts will be permanent; and the timeline for lane shifts.
  - Members discussed other large projects, including long-term relocation of Honoapiʻilani Highway; the funding source for improvements; the prioritization of relocation of the highway north and south of the existing bypass; and doing smaller increments for the northern bypass in favor of more work on the southern end of the highway; and the timeline for planning and other funding sources.
  - Resource person Lauren Armstrong spoke about Hele Mai Maui and further expanded on prioritization of the north vs. south extension, particularly that it's not an "either or" issue, as both extensions are listed as near-term priorities. She stressed that priority should be given to projects that are ready, and that more effort should be made to speed up planning for the southern extension.
- Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt/Keep as is**

Midway through discussion of Action 21, Hans Michel asked about preserving a mass transit corridor from Ritz Carlton to Kahului Airport. **(44:31 to 1:01:02)**

- Discussion:
  - Members discussed creating an action item and proposed language, as well as the merits of a corridor.
  - Lauren Armstrong noted that it would be wise to establish a corridor for future planning and that it is consistent with the Maui Bus's short range plan.
  - Staff noted that a similar action is already in the Maui Island Plan, and suggested having an action that specifies where the corridor would be.
- Consensus Decision(s): Staff will prepare language for a new action based on CPAC discussion

21. Work in partnership with State Department of Transportation to facilitate realignment of Honoapi'ilani Highway out of the coastal hazard zone, and manage the lands ma kai of the new highway as public parks and open space. (Department of Public Works) **(43:48 to 44:30; 1:01:02 to 1:12:02)**
- Discussion:
    - **Chair Nishiki suggested adding “prioritize and” before “facilitate.”**
    - Leilani Pulmano suggested removing “and manage the lands ma kai of the highway of the new highway as public parks and open space” because members do not know the exact placement of the highway.
      - **Some members preferred to keep the language as is; Leilani then moved to remove the language, and Yvette Celiz seconded the motion.** During this discussion, **staff proposed changing the language to “manage the public lands.” Leilani agreed with this proposal and retracted her motion.**
    - Members discussed limiting development ma kai of the new highway.
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt with Chair Nishiki’s and staff’s amended language**
22. Create a Transportation Improvement District per the 2018 Parking Action Plan to manage parking in Lahaina town and reinvest paid parking revenues in local transportation improvements such as a transit hub, improved bus service, street improvements, multiuse paths, and sidewalks. (Department of Public Works)
- Discussion: None
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt/Keep as is**
23. Improve resilience of the transportation system to climate change-related hazards such as sea level rise, flooding and wildfires. (Department of Public Works) **(1:14:01 to 1:17:27)**
- Discussion:
    - Ravi Bugga expressed concern that the action is too vague; Joseph Pluta read a definition of “resilience,” and Lauren Armstrong clarified the language. **Ravi suggested changing the action to a policy.**
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Change to policy and adopt**

## **Policies and Actions Related to Goal 2.4: Economic Opportunity Through Innovation and Collaboration (1:17:54 to END)**

### **POLICIES**

3. Option 1: No additional visitor units, except Bed and Breakfast Homes, shall be permitted in West Maui unless an equal number of workforce housing units are concurrently developed in the same subarea.

Option 2: No additional visitor units, except for Bed and Breakfast Homes, shall be permitted in West Maui until the supply of residential housing units equals the supply of visitor units. Once the supply of residential units exceeds the supply of visitor units in West Maui, new visitor units shall be permitted only if an equal number of workforce housing units are concurrently developed in the same area.

**(1:17:54 to 2:23:15)**

- Discussion:
  - Kate Blystone provided background on how staff came up with the language of the two proposed options, specifically the inclusion of “Bed and Breakfast Homes;” she noted that they are different from short-term rentals.
  - Angela Lucero suggested tying the visitor units to infrastructure (capacity of wastewater system, completion of projects in Long Range Transportation Plan, sufficient water supply, development of Hawaiian Homelands, etc.) instead of residential units.
  - Karen Comcowich suggested changing “equal number”/“equals the supply” to “greater than”; and including language that there be adequate infrastructure for any completed development projects.
  - Kate Blystone recommended Option 2 as it details what happens after the residential unit requirement is met. She also suggested clarifying the types of infrastructure so that it can somehow be quantified.
  - Members asked for clarification from staff on the gap between visitor units and residential units; whether units counts are by geographic area/subarea or region-wide; and the intention of the policy; whether hotel rooms and/or condos count as residential units; how this policy could be affected regarding managed retreat.

- Ravi Bugga preferred Option 2 and suggested removing “except for Bed and Breakfast Homes,” and move “in West Maui” from the first sentence to the end of the sentence.
  - **Yvette Celiz made a motion to adopt Option 2 as amended by Ravi; Angela Lucero seconded the motion.** Chair Nishiki and members Karen Comcowich, Ravi Bugga, Aina Kohler, Angela Lucero and Yvette Celiz voted in favor of the motion, while members Hans Michel, Joseph Pluta, Dylan Payne, Donald Gerbig, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom and Leilani Pulmano opposed. **6-6, MOTION FAILS. (1:55:16)**
- **Joseph Pluta made a motion to adopt Option 1; Donald Gerbig seconded the motion.**
  - Before voting, **Chair Nishiki proposed language to amend Joseph’s motion by adding Option 2’s second sentence to Option 1; Angela Lucero seconded Chair Nishiki’s proposed amendment.** Due to confusion regarding Parliamentary procedure, Chair Nishiki verified via Robert’s Rules that amendments to motions are allowed and read aloud the procedure. Members discussed the amendment before voting: Chair Nishiki and members Dawn Hegger-Nordblom, Angela Lucero, and Yvette Celiz were in favor of the proposed amendment, while members Hans Michel, Karen Comcowich, Joseph Pluta, Dylan Payne, Donald Gerbig, Ravi Bugga, Aina Kohler and Leilani Pulmano opposed. **4-8, AMENDMENT FAILS.**
  - **For Joseph’s original motion to adopt Option 1:** Chair Nishiki and members Hans Michel, Karen Comcowich, Joseph Pluta, Dylan Payne, Donald Gerbig, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom and Aina Kohler voted in favor of the motion, while members Ravi Bugga, Leilani Pulmano, Angela Lucero and Yvette Celiz opposed. **8-4, MOTION PASSES.**

## **ACTIONS**

2. Support the recommendations of the Mayor’s Tourism Group, the Maui Tourism Advisory Committee, and other best practices for tourism management in West Maui as appropriate to protect the area’s environment, culture, and character. (Office of Economic Development/Mayor’s Office)
  - Discussion: None
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt/Keep as is**

3. Develop and implement an economic development strategy for West Maui and coordinate with the Planning Department on required land use changes to implement the strategy. (Office of Economic Development) (2:24:07 to 2:25:00)
  - Discussion:
    - **Chair Nishiki proposed adding “of diversification” after “strategy.”**
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Adopt with amended language**
  
5. Deny or recommend denial of new Short Term Rental Home Permits, new hotels and hotel expansions in West Maui until the supply of residential housing units exceeds the supply of visitor units. (Department of Planning) (2:25:00 to 2:32:56)
  - Discussion:
    - Jennifer Maydan noted that Planning Director Michele McLean recommended adding this action to go along with Policy 3’s Option 2; since members instead adopted Option 1, Jennifer recommended not adopting the action.
    - **Joseph Pluta made a motion to remove Action 5; Donald Gerbig seconded the motion.** Members Hans Michel, Joseph Pluta, Dylan Payne, Donald Gerbig, Ravi Bugga and Leilani Pulmano voted in favor of the motion, while Chair Nishiki and members Karen Comcowich, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom, Aina Kohler, Angela Lucero and Yvette Celiz opposed. **6-6, MOTION FAILS.**
    - Karen Comcowich suggested amending the language to remove hotel expansions, and possibly even new hotels, from the action.
    - In respect for time, Kate Blystone recommended revisiting the action at a later date so that it can be considered more in-depth and staff can provide an accurate assessment of the consequences of including it, since it was not meant to go with option 1.
  - Consensus Decision(s): **Revisit**

Before Chair Nishiki adjourned the meeting, Pam Eaton voiced her appreciation for the policies and action discussion but also urged members to step away from policies and actions to focus on the Growth Framework management/Land Use portion of the Community Plan going into the new year.

**NEXT MEETING IS ON JANUARY 7, 2020. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:40 P.M.**

